



CLSF Latvijas Cilvēktiesību komiteja F.I.D.H. Latvian Human Rights Committee

МФПЛ Латвийский комитет по правам человека

Reg. No. 40008010632, address: 102a, Dzirnāvu Str. Riga, LV1050, Latvia. Phone +371 26420477

September 2016. Submission for Human Dimension Implementation Meeting
Working session 11, Tolerance and non-discrimination I

Discrimination in Latvia: persistent problems and 2015-2016 events

[1] Statelessness and rights of foreigners

Despite many international recommendations, also six from OSCE bodies,¹ the “non-citizens of Latvia” (a particular group of former USSR citizens and their descendants, who lack any citizenship now, while having right to reside in Latvia. As at July, 2016 – 247,104 residents, or 11.6 % of the population². Most are older than 55³) remain deprived of voting rights even in local elections. The next local elections are planned for June 3, 2017. Meanwhile, the naturalization rate has continued to slow down in 2015.⁴ Besides, their pensions rights for the time they had worked abroad remain limited, despite a 2009 ECtHR ruling.⁵

On a positive note, after a CJEU ruling against Latvia in September 2015⁶, citizens of other EU member states have been allowed to work as notaries, by amending⁷ the Notariate Law in November. “Non-citizens”, however, are still not allowed, despite their closer ties with Latvia.

One more difference between rights of EU citizens and “non-citizens” is going to be the right to vote in accordance with the draft Law on local referendums, currently considered by the Parliament.⁸

[2] Refugees

Latvia has agreed in 2015 to take less than 800 refugees from other EU countries. In December, 2015, the government has cut benefits for refugees from 256 to 139 EUR a month,⁹ after much rhetorics about the pensions in Latvia being low (indeed, they are).

¹ OSCE/ODIHR Final report on 2002 parliamentary elections in Latvia, part XI, para. 2; Parliamentary Assembly, July 2004, resolution on national minorities, para. 16; OSCE/ODIHR Final report on 2006 parliamentary elections in Latvia, part XV, para. 2; OSCE/ODIHR Final report on 2010 parliamentary elections in Latvia, part XV, para. 1; High Commissioner on National Minorities, statements to 868th and 1026th plenary meetings of the Permanent Council

² http://www.pmlp.gov.lv/lv/assets/documents/ledzivotaju%20re%C4%A3istrs/0107iedzregi/ISVP_Latvija_pec_VPD.pdf Row “LATVIJAS NEPIILSONIS” [non-citizen of Latvia] (LV).

³

http://www.pmlp.gov.lv/lv/assets/documents/ledzivotaju%20re%C4%A3istrs/0107iedzregi/ISVG_Latvija_pec_DZGada_VPD.pdf Column “Latvijas nepilsonis” [non-citizen of Latvia] (LV)

⁴ <http://www.pmlp.gov.lv/en/home/statistics/naturalization.html>

⁵ Andrejeva v. Latvia (Grand Chamber) 18.02.2009 (application no. 55707/00). A similar case Savickis and Others v. Latvia is pending.

⁶ C-151/14 <http://curia.europa.eu/juris/celex.jsf?celex=62014CJ0151&lang1=en&type=TXT&ancre=>

⁷ <http://likumi.lv/ta/id/278508-grozijumi-notariata-likuma> (LV)

⁸ Draft law No. 76/Lp12

⁹ Cabinet regulations No. 792 of 22.12.2015 <http://likumi.lv/ta/id/278915> (LV) Same amount kept in the Cabinet regulations No. 457 of 12.07.2016 <http://likumi.lv/ta/id/283578> (LV)

In February 2016, the cabinet led by Mr Māris Kučinskis took office. In the declaration on intended activities of the cabinet, unwillingness to support refugees is expressed: “Latvia has exhausted its possibilities to host additional asylum seekers within the framework of the European Union’s mechanism for relocation of asylum seekers”.¹⁰ Notably, as at 1 January, less than 200 residents of Latvia had been given refugee of alternative status¹¹.

In March 2016, the co-ruling National Alliance has published a call not to accept even the planned 776 asylum seekers from other EU countries, referring to the terror acts in Belgium and speaking of a possibility of a “numerically large, alien, inimical to the country” community.¹²

As a result of Latvian language skills requirements at workforce market and cutting benefits, 21 of those (23 or 69 – data differ in the source) refugees who were relocated to Latvia under EU refugee relocation scheme, have already left Latvia, as at September 2016.¹³

[3] Historical memory

On March, 16, 2016, an annual march honouring Waffen SS Latvian Legion veterans took place in the centre of Riga, with participation of MPs from the co-ruling National Alliance.

In advance, the counter-picket applied for by Latvian Anti-Nazi Committee had been ordered by Riga authorities to move farther from the route of the march, while a picket supportive for the march had been allowed in a closer place. An administrative court ruling upheld the restrictions.¹⁴

Several German anti-fascist activists, who intended to take part in the protests, have been prohibited from entering Latvia.¹⁵

[4] Language policy

In the declaration of the new Kučinskis cabinet (February, 2016), an intention to switch minority (bilingual) public schools to Latvian as the only language of instruction is announced: “A plan must be developed and launched for the transition to a unified education standard in the state language in state and local government funded educational institutions”.¹⁶ This is contrary to the position of the High Commissioner on National Minorities.¹⁷ Meanwhile, the number of minority schools has continued to fall in 2015/16, with a greater share of the minority schools, already few, being affected than Latvian language-only schools¹⁸:

Academic year	Latvian-language only schools	“Dual stream” schools (Latvian-language only classes and bilingual classes with some	Russian minority schools (overwhelmingly – bilingual ones)	Polish minority schools (all bilingual)
---------------	-------------------------------	--	--	---

¹⁰ http://www.mk.gov.lv/sites/default/files/editor/deklaracija_en.pdf See p. 10

¹¹ http://www.pmlp.gov.lv/lv/assets/documents/statistika/IRD2016/ISVP_Latvija_pec_VPD.pdf Rows “LATVIJAS ALTERNATĪVAIS” (Latvia’s alternative [status]) and “LATVIJAS BĒGLIS” (Latvia’s refugee [status]) (LV).

¹² <http://www.nacionalaapvieniba.lv/aktualitate/ir-jaatsakas-uznemt-776-patveruma-mekletajus/> (LV)

¹³ <http://www.lsm.lv/en/article/societ/society/refugees-leave-latvia-for-germany.a199612/>

¹⁴ Administrative District Court judgment in case no. A420165016 (shortened judgment on March 11, 2016, full on March 29)

¹⁵ <http://www.jpost.com/International/Nazi-Waffen-SS-veterans-join-controversial-march-in-Latvia-448126> Disclosure – plaintiff represented by a LHRC member

¹⁶ http://www.mk.gov.lv/sites/default/files/editor/deklaracija_en.pdf See p. 12

¹⁷ High Commissioner on National Minorities, statement to 1026th plenary meeting of the Permanent Council <http://www.osce.org/pc/127063?download=true>

¹⁸ Ministry of Education and Science. Annual statistics on the number of schools by medium of instruction - See “pa plusmam” (“by streams”). “Latviešu”=“Latvian”, “Krievu”=“Russian”, “Poļu”=“Polish” [language] http://www.izm.gov.lv/images/statistika/visp_izgl/2015_2016/Vs_skolu_sk_15.xlsx (LV)

		instruction in Russian)		
1998/1999	728	145	195	5
2014/2015	627	63	97	4
2015/2016	620	60	94	4

One of four remaining Polish schools is also under threat of closure, as reported in 2016.¹⁹

Moreover, in June, 2016, a long-functioning Russian-language private school *Innova* has been refused renewal of accreditation, based on claims (according to media reports, originating from Security Police) that some of the schools founders and teachers don't foster the cohesion of society, sense of belonging and loyalty to Latvia.²⁰

Supreme Court in February, 2016, has denied an opportunity to add a record of original name without Latvian-language endings (but still in Latin script) to passports of children born in independent Latvia, saying that the names recorded in birth documents (i.e., already-Latvianized) are the original ones.²¹

In March 2016, Latgale Regional Court has decided to deprive Mr Ivans Baranovs of his seat at Balvi Municipality Council due to his Latvian language skills being lower than required from local councillors by government regulations.²² The appeal is currently pending; one more similar case is ongoing in other court.

The State Language Center remains active in imposing fines, including²³ fining the Riga municipality for being present on social media not only in Latvian, but also in Russian, and fining a re-elected mayor of a small municipality on the eastern border for insufficient command of Latvian.²⁴

On a more positive note, the drastic language requirements for private radio stations have been slightly softened. Amendments of 2014 to the Electronic Mass Media Law provided for requiring an overwhelming majority of them (those currently having licenses providing for broadcasting 50 % or more time in Latvian) to switch to broadcasting all content in Latvian, starting from January, 2016. In the end of 2015, the relevant provision were changed,²⁵ postponing the draconian measure to 2017 and applying it to a somewhat smaller array of radio stations - those currently having licenses providing for broadcasting 51 % or more time in Latvian.²⁶ Still, the provisions continue to curtail freedom of choice for private media and to restrict multilingualism.

¹⁹ http://baltnews.lv/riga_news/20160129/1015523702.html (RU)

²⁰ Newspaper: report PB Riga school denied accreditation because of disloyalty <http://bignews2day.com/en/news/breaking-news-gazeta-posle-otcheta-pb-rizhskoj-shkole-otkazali-v-akkreditatsii-iz-za-nelojalnosti>

²¹ <http://at.gov.lv/lv/pazinojumi-presei/par-tiesas-sedem/2016/kasacijas-instance/7552-augstaka-tiesa-nav-transliterejams-personavards-kas-attieciga-civilstavokla-akta-registra-ieraksta-noradits-latviesu-valoda-un-kura-originalformu-cita-valoda-persona-dokumentari-nevar-apliecinat/> (LV) Disclosure – plaintiff represented by a LHRC member

²² <http://www.lsm.lv/ru/statja/politika/novosti/sud-soglasijsja-lishit-mandata-deputata-ot-soglasija-za-neznanie-latishskogo.a174924/> (RU) Disclosure – plaintiff represented by a LHRC member

²³ <http://rus.delfi.lv/news/daily/latvia/centr-gosyazyka-oshtrafoval-ushakova-za-obschenie-v-socsetyah-na-ruskom.d?id=47724067> (RU)

²⁴ <http://rus.delfi.lv/news/daily/latvia/ministerstvo-sud-mozhet-uvolit-ne-znayuschego-latyshskij-yazyk-mera-zilupe.d?id=47835201> (RU)

²⁵ Amendments of 17.12.2015, published on 05.01.2016, to the Electronic Mass Media Law <http://likumi.lv/ta/id/278985> (LV)

²⁶ Estimates from para. 1 of the annotation of the 2014 amendments – 50% threshold would have required 50 from 67 broadcasters to broadcast all content in Latvian. 51 % threshold would have applied for 37 broadcasters <http://titania.saeima.lv/LIVS11/SaeimaLIVS11.nsf/0/0E856AE90D704F79C2257CE6004BC796?OpenDocument> (LV)

As of April 2016, a draft regulation is pending under consideration in the Cabinet. It aims to impose Latvian language proficiency requirements on members of NGOs' executive bodies.²⁷

[5] Sexual orientation issues

In February 2016, the main Riga minibus public transportation company offered free rides on Valentine's day for kissing couples – different-sex only, despite objections by the Ombudsman.²⁸

[6] Hate crimes, including hate speech

On a positive note, one can point to the first-ever criminal case on inciting religious hatred, initiated in March, 2016.²⁹

[7] Incarceration rate

Data published in August, 2016, show discrepancies by ethnicity in prison population. Among inmates, there were 1761 ethnic Latvians, 1573 ethnic Russians, 175 ethnic Romani, in August.³⁰ On July 1, 2016, there were 1,281,315 ethnic Latvians, 561,854 ethnic Russians, 7545 Romani living in Latvia.³¹ Comparing the data, we get the following incarceration rate for 100,000 persons: ethnic Latvians – 137, ethnic Russians – 280, ethnic Romani – 2319.

[8] Recommendations for Latvia:

- To restore the network of minority schools and use of minority languages as languages of instruction. To differentiate Latvian language exam requirements for Latvian-only and minority (bilingual) schools.
- To grant voting rights to permanently resident “non-citizens” (and other permanent residents) in local elections. To simplify naturalization and to allow judicial review for all refusals to naturalise. To ensure automatic registration of newborn children of “non-citizens” as citizens of Latvia.
- To lower Latvian language requirements for local councillors so as not to interfere with popular choice and not to hinder minority participation in public life in Eastern Latvia.
- To allow “non-citizens” to work as notaries. To equate their rights to pensions with those of citizens.
- To allow use of minority languages in daily communication with local authorities, and to allow writing personal names in identity documents without Latvian-language gender endings and with those double consonants not doubled in Latvian.
- To condemn discourses: a) honouring those having collaborated with Nazi Germany; b) equating phenomenon of refugees to terrorism threats.
- To raise both the benefits for refugees and the minimal pension.
- To adopt a comprehensive anti-discrimination law. In the meantime: to add anti-discrimination provisions to the Law on Residential Tenancy; to include language, sexual orientation and gender identity in the lists of grounds of discrimination prohibited in the Education Law, Law on the Rights of Patients, Consumer Rights Protection Law and Law on Social Security.
- To allow submitting individual complaints under CEDAW and ICERD. To join the protocol to the Convention against Discrimination in Education.

P.S. A new issue which might be used against NGOs getting foreign funding is the draft law “Amendments to the Associations and Foundations Law” (No. 563/Lp12), adopted in the 1st reading in September, 2016.

²⁷ <http://tap.mk.gov.lv/lv/mk/tap/?pid=40371539&mode=mk&date=2016-04-05> (LV)

²⁸ <http://rus.delfi.lv/news/daily/latvia/rms-ne-izmenit-usloviya-akcii-zaplati-poceluem-v-den-sv-valentina.d?id=47058429> & <http://m.postimees.ee/section/933/3582513> (RU)

²⁹ <http://rus.delfi.lv/news/daily/latvia/pb-zavela-pervye-dela-o-razzhiganii-religioznoj-rozni.d?id=47236451> (RU)

³⁰ <http://www.lsm.lv/ru/statija/analitika/detektor-lzhi-pravdu-li-govorit-erik-stendzenieks.a195364/> (RU)

³¹ http://www.pmlp.gov.lv/lv/assets/documents/iedzivotaju%20re%C4%A3istrs/0107iedzregj/ISVN_Latvija_pec_TTB_VPD.pdf

(LV) Rows “CIGANS” [Roma], “KRIEVS” [ethnic Russian], “LATVIETIS” [ethnic Latvian], column “Kopā”.